

Green Open Space Management With Stakeholder Collaboration Approach In Bungkul Park Surabaya City

¹ Endang Widyawati

Master of Public Administration, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences
Universitas Hang Tuah Surabaya, Indonesia
endang.widyaaati@hangtuah.ac.id

² Edi Suhardono

Master of Public Administration, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences
Universitas Hang Tuah, Surabaya, Indonesia
edi.suhardono@hangtuah.ac.id

Budi Rianto

Master of Public Administration, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences
Universitas Hang Tuah, Surabaya, Indonesia
budi.rianto@hangtuah.ac.id

Abstract—Bungkul Park is a city park that was able to win an international award for the Best Park in Asia category from the United Nations (UN) in 2013. There is religious tourism, namely the tomb of Sunan Bungkul. The management of Bungkul Park is a collaboration between stakeholders from the Department of Environment, Department of Cooperatives, Small and Medium Enterprises and Trade, Department of Transportation and PDAM Surya Sembada Surabaya city. The purpose of this study is to analyze stakeholder collaboration in the green open space of Bungkul Park Surabaya and find out the factors that support and hinder stakeholder collaboration. The method used is qualitative research. Data sources were obtained from sources, observed events or activities, journals and documents. This research uses eight important items that can be used as a measure or indicator of successful collaboration, namely the theory of collaboration according to Edward DeSeve (2007). The results showed that each party involved in the collaboration has carried out its role in accordance with their respective fields even though it has not been fully optimized. Stakeholder collaboration in this study uses eight indicators of collaboration success factors, only two of which run optimally, namely the absence of actors/stakeholders who dominate the network/organization, the absence of hierarchy/monopoly and stakeholders involved in accordance with the authority of each agency. While the inhibiting factors are lack of commitment, lack of trust between stakeholders and limited information.

Keywords—Collaboration, Management, Park, Stakeholders, Surabaya

INTRODUCTION

Surabaya is one of the major cities in Indonesia and the capital of East Java province. Surabaya has an area of ± 326.81 km² with a population of 3,158,943 people in 2019. In that case, the level of activity of the people of Surabaya city is quite high. Surabaya is the capital of the province as well as the center of the East Java provincial government. Surabaya is classified as a metropolitan city, this causes the center of government, trade, industry, and social activities in the city center. The high mobility of these activities requires a park in the city as a space for human interaction and the urban environment.

Surabaya is a busy center of activity with a variety of complex activities, ranging from the center of education, arts, health to become an economic center. The rapid development of the city of Surabaya is very fast driven by economic activities, causing the arrangement and management of open space or urban space is increasingly difficult. With the increasing need and use of open space in the center of Surabaya city activities that are not balanced with the arrangement of good and appropriate open space resulting in urban space that is not feasible because of the arrangement that overrides aspects of a healthy, clean, comfortable and safe environment for users, especially for pedestrians who are one of the users of urban open space area facilities.

Regulations that have been issued by the government related to urban issues and the most recent ones related to urban planning and green open space (RTH) are Law No. 26 of 2007 concerning Spatial Planning (UUPR), Minister of Home Affairs Regulation No. 1 of 2007 concerning Green Open Space Arrangement in Urban Areas (RTHKP), and Minister of Public Works Regulation No. 5 of 2008 concerning Guidelines for the Provision and Utilization

of Green Open Space in Urban Areas. The existence of these regulations has caused urban trends in Indonesia to also shift towards increasing the development and management of urban parks.

Law No. 26 of 2007 in article 29 paragraphs 1, 2, and 3 stipulates that green open space areas for urban areas must reach 30% of the total urban area consisting of 20% as public green open space and the remaining 10% private green open space. Public green open spaces are managed and provided by the city/regency government and are used for the benefit of the community in general. Examples of public green open space (RTH) are city parks, urban forests, green belts, RTH around rivers, cemeteries, and railroad tracks. While private green open space (RTH) is managed and provided by the private sector and the community, whose utilization is for limited circles, among others, in the form of gardens or yard of houses / buildings owned by the community / private sector planted with plants.

The law has regulations that address the issue of green open space which is also regulated in more detail in the Regulation of the Minister of Home Affairs Number 1 of 2007 concerning the Arrangement of Urban Green Open Space. The regulation contains the arrangement of urban green open space (RTHK) which includes the objectives, functions, and benefits; establishment and types; arrangement; community participation; reporting; guidance and supervision; and funding of urban green open space, in article 9 paragraph (1) also states that the ideal area of RTHK is at least 20% of the urban area, including public and private green open space (RTHK).

The provision of Green Open Space (RTH) has the following objectives: 1). Maintain the availability of land as a water catchment area; 2). Creating urban planological aspects through a balance between the natural environment and the built environment that is useful for the benefit of the community; 3). Improving the harmony of the urban environment as a means of securing a safe, comfortable, fresh, beautiful, and clean urban environment. An urban area in which there are four main functions can be combined according to the needs, interests, and sustainability of the city such as water system protection, ecological balance, and biological conservation. Based on the Regulation of the Minister of Public Works Number 5 of 2008 concerning Guidelines for the Provision and Utilization of Green Open Space in Urban Areas, Green Open Space (RTH) can be physically divided into natural RTH in the form of natural wild habitats, protected areas and national parks and non-natural or built RTH such as parks, sports fields, cemeteries or green lanes. Green open space (RTH) can function ecologically, socially, culturally, aesthetically and economically.

In terms of spatial structure, green spaces can follow ecological patterns (grouped, elongated, scattered) or planological patterns that follow the hierarchy and structure of urban space. In terms of

ownership, RTH can be divided into Public RTH and Private RTH. Green Open Space (RTH) is an elongated area in the form of paths and / or grouped areas, the use of which is more open, where plants grow, both those that grow naturally and those that are deliberately planted. Based on the Surabaya City Regional Regulation, number 12 of 2014 concerning the Surabaya City Regional Spatial Plan 2014-2034, green open space is a land or area designated as open space for the growth of plants / vegetation that functions as a microclimate regulator, water catchment area and city aesthetics. Parks managed by the Surabaya City Environment Agency consist of 2 types of parks, namely active parks and passive parks. An active park is a park in which a park usage activity is built, so that park users actively use the facilities therein where visitors or park users can do activities freely in the park area. Passive parks are parks that can only be enjoyed for their visual beauty, as accentuation to attract attention, and because of their shadyness, but without holding activities in them, such as parks located at T-junctions, intersections, parks in the median of the road, and in green lanes.

The city is a manifestation of human activity that functions as a center of social, economic, governmental, political, and educational activities, as well as a provider of service facilities for the community, in its journey, the city experiences rapid development due to population dynamics, socio-economic changes, and interactions with other regions. Population density makes the existence of city parks a major necessity. Therefore, since 2002, Surabaya city has been actively improving the development and management of city parks. This seriousness was accompanied by the issuance of Regional Regulation No. 7 of 2002 concerning Green Open Space Management. In general, public open spaces in urban areas consist of green open spaces and non-green open spaces. Urban Green Open Space (RTH) is part of the open spaces of an urban area filled with plants, crops and vegetation (endemic or introduced) to support ecological, socio-cultural and architectural benefits that can provide economic benefits (welfare) for the community. Non-green open space can be in the form of paved open space and blue open space (RTB) in the form of river surfaces, lakes, and areas designated as retention puddles. Physically, RTH can be divided into natural RTH in the form of natural wild habitats, protected areas and national parks, as well as non-natural or built RTH such as parks, sports fields, and flower gardens. Ecologically, green spaces can improve groundwater quality, prevent flooding, reduce air pollution, and lower city temperatures.

Forms of urban green open space (RTH) that function ecologically include urban green belts, urban forests, botanical gardens, river borders etc. Socio-culturally the existence of green open space (RTH) can provide a function as a space for social interaction, recreational facilities, and as a cultural city tetenger. Forms of green open space (RTH) that function socio-

culturally include city parks, sports fields, botanical gardens, TPU and so on. The existence of urban open space in the form of green open space, in addition to the aesthetic aspect adds to the beauty with the presence of green open space can help the city of Surabaya avoid some problems such as flooding because it is able to provide land availability as a water catchment area. Maintain the balance of ecosystems in the city of Surabaya from the amount of pollution by creating urban planological aspects through a balance between the natural environment and the built environment that is useful for the benefit of society. In addition, the existence of green open space increases the harmony of the urban environment as a means of securing a safe, comfortable, fresh, beautiful and clean urban environment. It is also proven by the Surabaya City Government's hard efforts in restoring the function of green open space (RTH) in thirteen parks that were revitalized from the former public filling station (SPBU) land.

The Surabaya City Government has built many green open spaces for citizens to use, one of which is the city park. Bungkul Park is considered representative because it is one of the favorite parks visited by citizens. Enciety Business Consult (EBC), a leading business research company in Indonesia, has conducted a survey to 500 respondents in Surabaya. As a result, out of 30 city parks in Surabaya, around 65% of respondents chose Bungkul Park to be their most favorite place to visit. Bungkul Park was revitalized and inaugurated on March 21, 2007, carrying the theme Sport, Education, and Entertainment with various public facilities built in this park and equipped with various trees and flowers that make this park look cool and shady. Originally just a slum area, unkempt, and famous for being haunted, it is now a superior park and the pride of Surabaya City. On an area of 900 m², Taman Bungkul is able to combine cultural preservation and the needs of today's city parks and combines educational, religious, sports, interaction, recreational and economic functions.

Surabaya's Bungkul Park has won the international award "The 2013 Asian Townscape Award" (ATA) for Best Park in Asia from the United Nations (UN). The award also received support from the United Nations Habitat Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific, Asia Habitat Society, Asia Townscape Design Society, and Fukuoka Asia Urban Research Center. Thanks to Bungkul Park, Surabaya City is the only city in Indonesia that won the award.

Bungkul Park is located in the middle of the city and is strategic and has accessibility from all directions, easy to find for tourists who will visit. Besides being famous for being the best park in Southeast Asia, there are three (3) direct destinations, namely: 1. Religious Tourism, namely a pilgrimage to the tomb of Sunan Bungkul, a brief history of Sunan Bungkul was originally named Ki Ageng Supa, when he converted to Islam changed his name to Ki Ageng

Mahmudin, then called Sunan Bungkul. He was one of the scholars of Majapahit kingdom in the XV century, and still counted as the brother-in-law of Raden Rahmad or called Sunan Ampel. The beginning of the name of Bungkul Park is inseparable from his name, which is a figure who is very influential in the spread of Islam in Surabaya and surrounding areas, his grave is located behind this park, and becomes a place of pilgrimage for pilgrims. 2. Adequate facilities, namely Skate Park and BMX Track for connoisseurs of papa skating and playing bicycle skills, children's playground, Jogging Track, arena for exercise, wireless internet access, public toilets, parking area, available clean water that can be drunk directly, and is a comfortable place to just rest and unwind while enjoying the lush greenery. 3. Culinary Tourism, around the park scattered food peddlers with a variety of foods sold, even behind the park is also a center for street vendors who are quite well organized, with Suroboyan-style menus, such as Pecel Rice, Rawon Rice, Semanggi Suroboyo, Lontong Balap Wonokromo, Rujak Cingur and others. 4. Pasar Kaget, traders who usually sell during Car Free Day, can sell t-shirts with the Surabaya logo, honey, well-packaged food and drinks, agate, accessories for ontel bikes, various kinds of lighters and cigarette cases, watches and others (A. Tjahjoko, 2018).

There are various communities in Bungkul Park, namely: the Surabaya Bungkul Comic Community (KKBS), the BMX bicycle enthusiast community, the skateboard enthusiast community, the Surabaya Arek musician community. According to the results of research from Arviana Irmadella (2018) entitled Stakeholders Collaboration Model in the Management of Green Open Space (RTH) Bungkul Park, Surabaya City, the obstacles that occur in the collaborative model of managing Bungkul Park are the absence of special provisions as guidelines for all actors so that the roles, duties, and responsibilities of each actor as well as supervision procedures and targets to be achieved by collaboration tend to be unclear. Another obstacle in the collaborative model of Bungkul Park management is that there are still conflicts between several actors which are generally related to land use and these conflicts have not yet found a solution because the actors tend not to be open about the problems they face. This is because there has never been a meeting involving all collaboration actors and the role of DKRTH as coordinator in facilitating dialog between actors has not been maximized (Irmadella, 2018).

It is also clear that the absence of a complaint mechanism also causes most people to rarely provide criticism, suggestions, and opinions regarding the management of Bungkul Park. The surrounding community has also not been much involved in park management actions, thus marking the lack of community participation in the collaborative management of Bungkul Park. Another obstacle is the limited parking lot which causes the parking arrangement in the park to be untidy and often causes

congestion around the park, especially when certain activities are held at Bungkul Park Surabaya. Collaboration can be defined as working together or working together with others. This explains that an actor or an individual, group or organization collaborates in several businesses. Each person who collaborates with others has certain terms and conditions which vary greatly. The word "collaboration" was originally used in the nineteenth century in the development of industrialization, the emergence of more complex organizations in the division of labor. Scott London defines collaboration as follows: "As suggested by the Latin roots *com* and *laborate*, collaboration reduced to its simplest definition means 'working together'. Collaboration has broad appeal to people from different positions on the political spectrum, not because it offers everything to everyone (as suggested by some of the literature advocating collaboration), but because collaboration deals with processes, as opposed to programs, agendas, or outcomes. Collaboration encourages us to look at the process by which we arrive at political choices, whatever those choices may be".

Collaboration is not limited by a certain time or period, as long as there are matters that have intersections or intersections with other parties, collaboration is still needed. Collaboration involves several parties starting from the individual, work group, and organizational levels. In carrying out collaboration, it is very important to understand the performance of public institutions. Therefore, the study of collaboration focuses more on the organizational level of public sector organizations. The involvement of the private sector and the community in the development of green open space (RTH) can be said to be stakeholder collaboration. Where it is a form of collaboration that emerges as a strategy in governing by involving many parties in the process. The participation of stakeholders such as local government, the private sector, and the community is important to achieve consensus in decision-making. A research study shows that all stakeholders are ready to participate in the management and governance of urban green spaces. Therefore, it demonstrates the need to bring together various local power centers through collaborative and co-management schemes, as depicted in the polycentric governance framework, to build an efficient, sustainable and socially equitable urban green space system.

In Indonesia, the suggestion to involve the government, the private sector and the community in the management and public policy of the environmental sector is enshrined in several government regulations, one of which is Law Number 32 of 2009 concerning Environmental Protection and Management. Government initiatives patterned after stakeholder collaboration seem to continue to grow in various regions along with the regional autonomy agenda. This statement is based on a portrait of environmental management and control that includes the private sector and the community actively from

formulation to program evaluation. The complexity of urban park management is difficult for the government to do alone, so it is necessary to cooperate with other parties in a collaborative framework. Collaboration is needed in order to fund and inject expertise that is not owned by the government related to city park management. In the book John Wanna, Thompson and Perry in the journal Irviana Irmadella (2018) define collaboration as an effort to work together or work with other parties involving various individual actors, groups, or organizations to realize certain goals.

Collaboration can influence the success of Bungkul Park's green open space management. Institutionalization in the management of urban parks has now shifted from government-based management to collaborative-based management, especially after the issuance of the Minister of Home Affairs Regulation No. 1 of 2007 concerning Green Open Space Arrangement in Urban Areas (RTHKP) and the Minister of Public Works Regulation No. 05/PRT/M of 2008 concerning Guidelines for the Provision and Utilization of Green Open Space in Urban Areas which recommends that RTH management should be carried out collaboratively. The implementation and management of a new management system that involves many parties with various interests is a challenge in itself while it can make the management more effective. This collaborative effort can later be used as a study and recommendation for the application of a potential stakeholder-based park management system so as to provide learning and improvement of park management in other areas in the future. Therefore, based on the background and exposure that has been stated above, researchers are interested in making a literature study on Green Open Space (RTH) Management with a Stakeholder Collaboration Approach in Bungkul Park, Surabaya City.

RESEARCH METHOD

The research method is a scientific way to obtain data with a specific purpose, and is a scientific procedure that must be carried out systematically to obtain data in order to answer the problem under study. The approach in this study uses a qualitative approach, as a theoretical basis in understanding the qualitative approach based on the opinion according to Sugiyono (2010) qualitative research is used to describe and analyze phenomena, events, social activities, attitudes, beliefs, perceptions, thoughts of people individually or in groups.

Qualitative research is a research method based on the philosophy of post positivism, used to research on natural object conditions, where the researcher is the key instrument, data collection techniques are triangulated (combined), data analysis is inductive or qualitative, and qualitative research results emphasize meaning rather than generalization. Qualitative research requires accuracy, an objective and humble attitude from a researcher (Sugiyono, 2010). In this

qualitative descriptive data will be taken as true as possible, where the author will describe the management of Green Open Space (RTH) with a collaborative approach of stakeholders in Bungkul Park, Surabaya City.

Activities in qualitative data analysis are carried out interactively and take place continuously until completion so that the data is saturated, activities in data analysis such as data reduction, data presentation, and conclusions (Miles, Huberman, and Saldana, 2014). From this theory, it can be concluded that data analysis techniques in research use four methods, namely data collection, data reduction, data presentation and conclusions.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

To analyze in depth about the collaboration model of stakeholders in the Management of Green Open Space (RTH) Bungkul Park Surabaya City comes from Edward DeSeve's (2007) theory with 8 (eight) indicators of successful collaboration, namely: 1) Network Structure, 2) Commitment to a Common Purpose, 3) Trust Among the Participants, 4) Clarity in Governance, 5) Access to Authority, 6) Distributive Accountability/Responsibility, 7) Information Sharing and 8) Access to Resources.

1. Data Presentation

1.1. Network Structure

In the principle of networked structure, network elements should not form a hierarchy, namely the power of one party because it will not be effective. The network structure must be organic with an organizational structure that is as flat as possible, there is no hierarchy of power, domination and monopoly. So, all parties have equal rights, obligations, responsibilities, authority and opportunities for accessibility in achieving common goals. Collaborative management of Bungkul Park includes stakeholders with different roles, duties and responsibilities. The management of Surabaya Bungkul Park under the supervision of the Environmental Service is a regional apparatus of the Surabaya City Government which acts as the leading sector of Surabaya city park management. The role of the Department of Cooperatives, Small and Medium Enterprises and Trade in the management of Bungkul Park Open Space in fostering street vendors (PKL) is in the management of the Culinary Tourism Center (SWK). Street vendors (PKL) in Bungkul Park are members of the Trisula group which was established in 1999. In 2006, the Surabaya Department of Cooperatives, Small and Medium Enterprises and Trade made street vendors in Bungkul Park an association under the name PKL Trisula.

PDAM Surya Sembada Surabaya city is one of the companies that implement Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR). Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) is one of the activities carried out by companies as a form of their social responsibility to the community and the surrounding environment and the community at large to stakeholders. CSR itself is a program that consists of two types, namely

partnership programs and environmental development. One form of environmental development CSR carried out by PDAM Surya Sembada Surabaya city is in the form of assistance in the development of public facilities and / or infrastructure in the form of Ready to Drink Water Taps (KASM). The basis for the establishment of the KASM program is Government Regulation No.122 of 2015 concerning the Development of Drinking Water Supply Systems. KASM began operating on August 11, 2009. The overall network structure in this collaboration does not form a hierarchy, but rather tends to be flat and there is no monopoly. Each stakeholder has a role and actively participates in the network. So it can be concluded that the type of network structure that exists in collaboration here is the self-governance type, where each stakeholder participates in the network and management is carried out by all members.

1.2. Commitment to a Common Purpose

Commitment to a common purpose is an element that refers to the reason why a network should exist, namely because of concern and commitment to achieving goals. This goal is usually articulated in the general mission of a government organization (DeSeve, 2007 in Sudarno 2011: 113). The commitment of the Department of Cooperatives, Small and Medium Enterprises and Trade in the management of Surabaya Bungkul Park is limited to the arrangement of the Culinary Tourism Center (SWK) which amounts to 50 booths. The Department of Transportation in managing the green open space of Surabaya Bungkul Park in providing Electronic Parking (e-parking) or parking meters is a tool used to measure the length of time parking and receive payment for parking electronically. The Ready to Drink Water Tap (KASM) in Bungkul Park since Pandemic closed until now is not functioning because there has been no request to activate KASM again from the party that has the KASM unit, namely the Environmental Service. In collaboration in green open space management, the commitment of each stakeholder is still lacking so that collaboration does not work well because the agreed activities are not continuously carried out.

1.3. Trust Among the Participants

Trust Among the Participants is a professional or social relationship, and the belief that participants trust the information or efforts of other stakeholders or stakeholders in a network to achieve common goals. Related to trust in information or data from each stakeholder in the collaborative management of Taman Bungkul green open space, it already exists. The role of the Department of Cooperatives, Small and Medium Enterprises and Trade in managing the green open space of Bungkul Park is limited to the management of culinary tourism centers. Trust and responsibility are in accordance with the main tasks and work functions of each agency. Based on the results of interviews that have been conducted, the emergence of lack of trust due to lack of communication and coordination from each

stakeholder. Trust is needed in collaboration so it is necessary to build trust and communication if there are problems that arise.

1.4. Clarity in Governance

Governance is a trusting relationship between governance actors. In addition, there are mutually agreed rules from each stakeholder, and there is freedom to determine how collaboration is carried out. Governance includes: a. the boundaries of who can be involved and who cannot be involved, b. rules that define a number of restrictions on the behavior of community members about what things should be done and what things should not be done, c. freedom to determine how collaboration is carried out, and d. network management regarding the resolution of resistance/challenges, resource allocation, quality control and organizational maintenance. The role and contribution of the Department of Cooperatives, Small and Medium Enterprises and Trade to the management of the green open space of Bungkul Park is limited to the management of the culinary tourism center in which there are street vendors assisted by the Department of Cooperatives, Small and Medium Enterprises and Trade.

The Surabaya City Government issued the innovation of Surabaya Electronic Parking (e-parking) in the form of parking meters. Through the Surabaya City Transportation Agency, electronic parking or smart parking is implemented. The program is a service for the community in the field of parking in order to improve comfort, safety and be more efficient and effective. PDAM Surya Sembada Surabaya City is a company engaged in drinking water services that has a concern for social responsibility and the environment around it. The form of concern is the CSR program in the form of assistance in the development of public facilities and or infrastructure in the form of Ready to Drink Water Taps (KASM). Until now there has been no Standard Operating Procedure (SOP) regarding KASM. Based on the results of interviews conducted, the contributions and roles of stakeholders are clear, in accordance with the main tasks of each agency, who are members. Standard operating procedures in collaboration between stakeholders do not yet exist.

1.5. Access to Authority

Access to Authority is the availability of clear and widely accepted measures or provisions of procedures. The management of the Culinary Tourism Center in the green open space of Taman Bungkul is the authority and authority of the Office of Cooperatives, Small and Medium Enterprises and Trade. There are written rules that explain how to apply for a permit to use the Food and Beverage Center in accordance with Surabaya's Perwali number 78 of 2016 (article 1).

The procedure for applying for a Food and Beverage Center Usage Permit based on Surabaya Mayor Regulation number 76 of 2016 is as follows: a. The applicant submits a written application to the head of the Office of Cooperatives, Small and Medium Enterprises and Trade by filling out the application

form, attaching the requirements consisting of: 1. photo copy of Identity Card, 2. 2 recent 4x6 cm photos, 3. recommendation from the local sub-district head, 4. a statement letter with sufficient stamp duty, stating: a) does not yet have a permanent place of business, b) the ability to maintain beauty, order, security, cleanliness and health and not to remodel, add and change the functions and facilities that exist in the place or at the location of the food and beverage center. c) the ability to maintain, care for and preserve the Food and Beverage Center Stand building in order to achieve a safe, comfortable and orderly Food and Beverage Center Stand environment, d) not selling goods that are prohibited from being traded by applicable regulations, e) not transferring to other parties the food and beverage centers that are utilized. f) the ability to carry out the obligations set out in the Food and Beverage Center Usage Permit. g) willingness to leave the food and beverage center stand without compensation and any conditions if after being given a warning it still does not fulfill the obligations set out in the Food and Beverage Center Usage Permit.

1.6. Distributive Accountability/Responsibility

Distributive Accountability / Responsibility is structuring, managing, managing together with stakeholders and sharing a number of decision-making to all network members and sharing responsibility for achieving the desired results. The Environmental Agency has responsibility to the Surabaya City Government for the management of green open spaces, especially city parks. The management of Bungkul Park, which is the authority of the Environmental Service, requires the work functions of other government agencies to support the management of Bungkul Park in Surabaya. Based on the results of interviews conducted, the division of accountability / responsibility of each stakeholder is only in accordance with the responsibilities of each agency / department, not jointly sharing responsibilities.

1.7. Information Sharing

Information Sharing is easy access for members, privacy protection, and limited access for non-members as long as it is acceptable to all parties. Regular meetings held by the Department of Cooperatives, Small and Medium Enterprises and Trade with traders discuss operational fees for the Culinary Tourism Center (SWK) and facilities and infrastructure. Every 2 to 3 months an evaluation meeting with Kali Lima Traders (PKL). Based on the results of interviews conducted, the delivery of information to each stakeholder has not run optimally because there are no regular meetings between stakeholders. Communication that often occurs within the scope of each stakeholder.

1.8. Access to Resources

Access to Resources is the availability of financial, technical, human and other resources needed to achieve network objectives. A program or activity can run when supported by resources, especially the availability of financial and human resources.

However, in reality, financial and human resources are limited and inadequate. The Environmental Agency places a field coordination officer (korlap) who oversees the task force and linmas of 6 people each who are on duty at Bungkul Park. One korlap can oversee several active city parks. The Office of Cooperatives, Small and Medium Enterprises and Trade places 1 (one) personnel for every 2 culinary tourism centers (SWK). Culinary tourism centers include street vendors (PKL) who are fostered by the Office of Cooperatives, Small and Medium Enterprises and Trade. There is supervision and maintenance from the Office of Cooperatives, Small and Medium Enterprises and Trade.

The Department of Transportation in providing parking meters in Bungkul Park, of which there are 10 units, only 6 units are still active and can be operated while 4 units are damaged and have not been repaired until now. PDAM Surya Sembada in maintaining KASM at all KASM points in Surabaya, there are 3 personnel who have their own schedule. Unfortunately in reality, the need for human resources cannot be said to be sufficient.

CONCLUSION

Based on the results of the analysis, it can be concluded that the management of green open space with a collaborative approach of stakeholders in Bungkul Park, Surabaya city is:

1. Of the eight indicators of collaboration used in this study, it shows that collaboration between stakeholders that takes place in Taman Bungkul Surabaya is less than optimal. This is indicated by only two (2) factors that are optimal in the implementation of collaboration between stakeholders in the management of Bungkul Park.

2. From the optimal / supporting factors, it shows that there is a well-structured collaboration, the absence of dominance and monopoly and the stakeholders involved are in accordance with the authority of each agency in the management of Bungkul Park Surabaya.

3. Efforts made by in the management of green open spaces with a collaborative approach of stakeholders in Bungkul Park, Surabaya City, especially the Environmental Agency as the leading sector, are still not optimal in managing Bungkul Park Surabaya because there is no meeting involving all stakeholders to discuss actions related to the management of Bungkul Park so that it can capture all problems and minimize misunderstandings and strengthen stakeholder collaboration in the management of green open spaces in Bungkul Park, Surabaya City.

REFERENCES

Alam, R., & Lovett, J. C. (2019). Prospects of public participation in the planning and management of urban green spaces in Lahore: A discourse analysis.

Sustainability (Switzerland), 11(12).
<https://doi.org/10.3390/su10023387>

Andriani, A. (2019). Collaborative Governance in the Development of Tanjung Bersinar Park Green Open Space in Tabalong Regency. University of Muhammadiyah Malang.

Ansell, Chris, & Gash, A. (2008). Collaborative governance in theory and practice. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, 18(4), 543-571.
<https://doi.org/10.1093/jopart/mum032>

Ansell, Christopher. (2011, September 7). Pragmatist Democracy: Evolutionary Learning as Public Philosophy.
<https://doi.org/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780199772438.001.0001>

Arfiansyah, R., & Prabawati, I. (2016). Implementation of Corporate Social Responsibility for Drinking Water Faucets of PDAM Surya Sembada Surabaya City. *Kran Air Siap Minum (KASM) Study*, 1-7.

Abdoellah, Awan, Y. Yudi Rusfianan. (2016). *Theory and Analysis of Public Policy*. Alfabeta: Bandung

Basuki, J. (2021). *Public Administration Theoretical and Empirical Review*. Jakarta: Raja Grafindo Persada.

Beddy Iriawan Maksudi, 1956- (author). (2017; © 2017, at the author). *Fundamentals of public administration : from classical to contemporary / Beddy Iriawan Maksudi*. Jakarta :: PT RajaGrafindo Persada,.

Chazienul Ulum M. 1974- (author); Rispa Ngindana, 1986- (author). (2017). *Environmental governance: issues, policies and environmental governance / M. Chazienul Ulum, Rispa Ngindana*. Malang:: UB Press,.

DeSeve, G. E. (2007). *Creating Managed Networks as a Response to societal Challenges*. *The Business of Government*, 47-52. Retrieved from

http://www.businessofgovernment.org/sites/default/files/BOG_Spring07.pdf

Dewi, R. T. (2016). Factors Affecting Collaborative Governance in Small Industry Development (Case Study on Reyog Crafts and Reyog Performances in Ponorogo Regency). *Sebelas Maret University*, 6, 1-123. Retrieved from <https://digilib.uns.ac.id/dokumen/download/27844/NTg4OTQ=/Faktor-Faktor-Yang-Mempengaruhi-Collaborative-Governance-Dalam-Pengembangan-Industri-Kecil-Studi-Kasus-Tentang-Kerajinan-Reyog-Dan-Pertunjukan-Reyog-Di-Kabupaten-Ponorogo-RATNA-TRISUMA-DEWI-S240809>

Emerson, K., Nabatchi, T., & Balogh, S. (2012). An integrative framework for collaborative governance.

Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory, 22(1), 1-29. <https://doi.org/10.1093/jopart/mur011>

Islamy, La Ode Syaiful. (2018). *The Concept of Collaborative Governance and How it is Applied in Government*. ISBN:978-602-475-963-6

Irmadella, A. (2018). Stakeholders Collaboration Model in the Management of Green Open Space (RTH) Bungkul Park, Surabaya City. *Public Policy and Management*, 6(2), 1-11.

Morse, R. S., & Stephens, J. (2009). *Teaching Collaborative Governance: Phases, Competencies, and Case-Based Learning*. JSTOR, 18(19).

Mutiarawati, T., & Sudarmo. (2017). Collaborative Governance in Rob Handling in Bandengan Village, Pekalongan City. *Journal of Public Discourse*, 1(2), 48-62.

Miles, Mathew B.; Huberman, A. Michael; Tjetjep Rohendi Rohidi; Mulyarto. (1992). *Qualitative data analysis : a sourcebook of new methods / Matthew B. Miles, A. Michael Huberman ; translator, Tjetjep Rohendi ; companion, Mulyarto*. Jakarta :: University of Indonesia Publishers (UI -Press),.

Maulida, R. R. (2015). *The Concept of Public Green Space Provision through Public Private Partnership in Malang City*. Surabaya: Sepuluh November Institute of Technology

Oktarizka, Reviandani. (2019). *Strategic Planning of the Surabaya City Government in the Management of Public Green Open Space (Study at the Surabaya City Cleanliness and Green Open Space Office)*: Brawijaya University, Malang

Rosawatiningsih, N. (2019). Management Policy of Green Open Space (Rth) Taman Flora Surabaya. *The Journal of Society & Media*, 3(1), 68. <https://doi.org/10.26740/jsm.v3n1.p68-85>

Republic of Indonesia. (2007). *Law Number 26 Year 2007 on Spatial Planning*. Cabinet Secretariat of the Republic of Indonesia. Jakarta.

Republic of Indonesia. (2007). *Regulation of the Minister of Home Affairs Number 1 of 2007 on the Arrangement of Urban Green Open Space (RTHKP)*. Secretariat of the Cabinet of the Republic of Indonesia. Jakarta.

Republic of Indonesia. (2008). *Regulation of Minister of Public Works Number 5 of 2008 on Guidelines for the Provision and Utilization of Green Open Space in Urban Areas*. Secretariat of the Cabinet of the Republic of Indonesia. Jakarta.

Republic of Indonesia. (2009). *Law Number 32 of 2009 on Environmental Protection and Management*. Secretariat of the Cabinet of the Republic of Indonesia. Jakarta.

Republic of Indonesia. (2014). *Surabaya City Regional Regulation Number 12 of 2014 concerning the Surabaya City Regional Spatial Plan*.